



EN

This action is funded by the European Union

ANNEX

of the Commission Decision on the financing of the annual action programme 2019 in favour of the Republic of Botswana

Action Document for the Support Programme for Technical and Vocational Education and Training Reforms in Botswana

1. Title/basic act/ CRIS number	Support Programme for Technical and Vocational Education and Training reforms in Botswana CRIS number: BW/FED/38602 financed under 11 th European Development Fund (EDF)	
2. Zone benefiting from the action/location	Botswana The action shall be carried out nationwide	
3. Programming document	11 th EDF National Indicative Programme	
4. Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)	Main SDGs: SDG 4 – “Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all”; SDG 8 - “Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all” and SDG 5 - “Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls”. Secondary SDGs: SDG 1 “End poverty in all its forms everywhere”; SDG 2 “End hunger; achieve food security and improved nutrition and sustainable agriculture”. The crosscutting support to good sector governance, participatory policy definition and strengthened institutions also contribute to SDG 10 “Reduce inequality within and among countries” and SDG 17 (target 17.7) to “encourage and promote effective public-private, and civil society partnerships”.	
5. Sector of intervention/ thematic area	Inclusive and sustainable growth / shared prosperity and skills for jobs	DEV. Assistance: YES
6. Amounts concerned	Total estimated cost: EUR 13 000 000 Total amount of EDF contribution EUR 13 000 000 of which EUR 10 000 000 for budget support, EUR 2 700 000 for complementary support, EUR 300 000 for evaluation and audits.	
7. Aid modalities and implementation modalities	Direct management through: – Budget Support: Sector Reform Contract Indirect management with Member State Agency – Delegation Agreement with Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) for implementation of complementary support.	

8 a) DAC codes	11110 – Education Policy and Administrative Management 11130 – Teacher Training 11322 – Upper Secondary Education 11330 – Vocational Training 15170 - Women's Equality Organisations and Institutions			
b) Main Delivery Channel	13000- Third Country Government			
9. Markers (from CRIS DAC form)¹	General policy objective	Not targeted	Significant objective	Principal objective
	Participation development/good governance	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	X
	Aid to environment	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Gender equality and Women's and Girl's Empowerment ²	<input type="checkbox"/>	X	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Trade Development	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Reproductive, Maternal, New born and child health	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	RIO Convention markers	Not targeted	Significant objective	Principal objective
	Biological diversity	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Combat desertification	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Climate change mitigation	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Climate change adaptation	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
10. Global Public Goods and Challenges (GPGC) thematic flagships	N.A.			

SUMMARY

The proposed project supports developing and aligning the technical and vocational education and training (TVET) system in Botswana.

Its overall objective is to contribute to sustainable and inclusive economic development through the reduction of unemployment, especially among the youth. The project's specific objective is to increase the availability of TVET graduates including women, men and minority ethnic groups with labour market relevant skills.

This specific objective will be met through three expected results, which stem from the main problems identified as the causes of the large deficits of high quality and relevant skilled workers in strategic areas of national development. These results are: (1) policy and strategic management capacities of the relevant TVET actors and institutions are reinforced and coordination mechanisms among them and with the employers – public and private sectors - have being institutionalised and are operating; (2) the TVET system is aligned with the policy

¹ When a marker is flagged as significant/principal objective, the action description should reflect an explicit intent to address the particular theme in the definition of objectives, results, activities and/or indicators (or of the performance / disbursement criteria, in the case of budget support).

² Please check the Minimum Recommended Criteria for the Gender Marker and the Handbook on the OECD-DAC Gender Equality Policy Marker. If gender equality is not targeted, please provide explanation in section 4.5.Mainstreaming.

framework and integrated in one single TVET system, with improved quality and relevant curricula and qualifications; and (3) the transition to the labour market is improved and a gender sensitive strategy to employability is developed and tested.

The proposed action is fully in line with the National Development Plan 11 (NDP 11), the country's Education and Training Sector Strategic Plan (ETSSP 2015-2020) and with the priorities set in the EU – Botswana 2014-2020 National Indicative Programme (NIP).

Budget support is considered to be the appropriate implementation modality for this programme since the country meets the eligibility criteria and it is important to reinforce the country's policy, management and coordination framework in TVET. The policy dialogue and the joint monitoring of results will contribute to a sustainable, country-led progress in these areas. The provision of technical assistance to the relevant actors in the TVET sector is proposed to be implemented through a delegation agreement with GIZ. The Technical Assistance (TA) should assist, inter alia, on the (i) development of specialized curricula in the areas selected as priorities in Government plans, (ii) implementation of approaches and tools for demand-oriented and gender sensitive TVET at vocational training institutions, (iii) improve monitoring and coordination mechanisms among relevant stakeholders, (iv) national assessments of TVET trainees, (v) integration of new programmes on the National Credit and Qualifications Framework (NCQF).

The action contributes directly to the implementation of the “EU-Africa Alliance for sustainable investments and jobs”, which identifies skills development at African level as one of its priority actions.

1 CONTEXT ANALYSIS

1.1 Context Description

Since its independence, over a period of half a century, Botswana has risen from one of the ten least-developed countries to an upper middle-income country, with a success built around the transformation of its natural resources into human capital and infrastructure, through effective macro-economic management. Although diamonds remain the dominant source of revenue, there has been an increased contribution of other sectors to growth, such as construction, financial services, tourism and manufacturing. These non-mining sectors are, however, largely dependent on Government spending, which in turn is dependent on the mining sector. The public sector, including both Government and parastatals, plays a major role in the economy. The public sector evidences serious gaps in terms of efficiency, quality of service delivery, effectiveness, capacities and an overall lack of monitoring and evaluation.

The private sector is struggling to grow, remaining heavily dependent on public sector patronage; its development is constrained by society's widespread reliance on government support, risk aversion and lack of entrepreneurship culture, with added significant constraints at macro-economic level. Despite some progress in diversifying the economy, the economic base of the country remains too narrow to ensure sustainable growth over the next decades as the contribution of income from minerals is expected to decrease. The current unemployment rate is 17.7 %, youth unemployment, 25.2% with female unemployment higher than that of males at 26.9 percent compared to 23.6 percent for males (2015/16 Botswana Multi- Topic Survey, Statistics Botswana, August 2017). Outside the public sector, low incomes and underemployment are serious problems. Key factors underlying high unemployment are: a

relatively undiversified economy; a large public sector that may be crowding out the growth of the private sector; a challenging business environment and regulatory framework that tends to limit growth and productivity of businesses and a small informal sector, effectively constrained by rigid trade regulations³. Furthermore, Botswana is one of the countries with high HIV/AIDS rates, with approximately 18.5 % of the total population infected (BAIS IV, 2013), and with young women disproportionately affected.

With a Gini coefficient of 60.5 according to the 1999 World Bank Gini index, Botswana ranks among countries with high income disparities, evidencing how growth alone is not sufficient to eliminate poverty and reduce inequalities. Poverty is concentrated in rural areas, particularly in the North and Western regions, with higher incidence among less advantaged groups and the youngest Batswana who represent 57 % of the poor. Reducing poverty and inequality will require much higher rates of employment, both formal and informal, which can only be achieved through a vibrant private sector growth.

The TVET sector delivers insufficient numbers of graduates. These graduates do not have required industry standard competencies. Also the offer is often not related to priority economic sectors. Curricula are outdated and lack relevance. Responsibilities for the TVET sector are scattered and fragmented and there is no sector coordination/governance.

Effective implementation of the TVET reforms is paramount to providing the market with the skills that are needed either for employment and/or self-employment. Both skills mismatch and the lack of available jobs contribute to the high youth unemployment rates the country is facing. The youth needs to be empowered with skills that meet the market requirements (technical skills, soft skills and work ethics) in order to get jobs, and with entrepreneurial skills complemented by policies that support entrepreneurship (guidance and mentorship, access to credit) in order to create self-sustained employment.

Constituting the government education institutions for General Education, Botswana has 755 Primary Schools, 207 Junior Secondary Schools, 34 Senior Secondary Schools, 37 Brigades and 8 Technical Colleges. Implementation of ETSSP focuses on these institutions and the surrounding management structures (Head Office, Regional structures, Sub-Regions, and, finally, the schools/brigades/colleges themselves).

Education and TVET in Botswana fall under the responsibility of three ministries. The Ministry of Employment, Labour Productivity, and Skills Development (MELSD) is tasked to implement reforms for skills development and pre-tertiary TVET, while the Ministry of Basic Education (MoBE) and the Ministry of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology (MoTE) are also involved in the technical and vocational training. These will need to establish robust ways of collaboration in order not to further fragment the sector.

Although not involved in TVET policy and implementation of reforms, the Ministry of Youth Empowerment, Sports and Culture (MYSC) is also an important player regarding the implementation of skills' development programmes for early-school leavers and out of school youth.

There are three support institutions for the sector: the Botswana Qualifications Authority (BQA) with the mandate to accredit subjects, courses, degree programmes and qualifications. Private TVET institutions, teachers, assessors and moderators are registered at BQA; the

³ BoB, Annual report 2015.

Botswana Examination Council (BEC) that manages the assessments: examinations for schools, Madirelo Training and Testing Center (MTTC) and Construction Industry Trust Fund (CITF); and the Human Resources Development Council (HRDC) in charge of bringing together the demand and supply of skills and hosts the Labour market observatory (LMO).

Two NGOs are involved in training with MoU with the MYSC: Young Africa Botswana (part of Young Africa International) providing TVET, short courses, skills training, and Stepping Stones, part of Stepping Stones International delivering skills training and support of Youth in Schools.

Regarding women specifically, as key actors for business development several women's organisations are established at local level, and gender groups are organised at wards and District Councils. A national Woman in Business association (WI-BA) is anchored to Business Botswana, with ambitions constrained by limited capacities and resources, as referred by VET toolbox mission in the "*Rapid Labour Market Assessment on Tourism and Livestock Sectors 2018*".

1.2 Policy Framework (Global, EU)

The Government of Botswana's (GoB) policies are well aligned with the EU Agenda for Change⁴, the New European Consensus on Development⁵, as well as the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness (2005), the Accra Agenda for Action (2008) and the African Union Agenda 2063.

The TVET Sector Reform Programme integrates key elements of the 2011 EU Agenda for Change, the United Nations 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, the EU's response to the Agenda 2030⁶ and the New European Consensus on Development, including a focus on: i) inclusive and sustainable economic growth (Prosperity); ii) women's empowerment and youth engagement (People); In addition, the programme is in line with the EU Plan of Action on gender equality and women's empowerment in development and the EU Gender Action Plan II (2016-2022), in particular objective 13; It is also in line with the increased effort from the EU to give attention to vocational training, as specified in more detail in the framework of the Staff Working Document "More and Better Education in Developing Countries" (2010).

The country policy framework is coherent with the Agenda 2030, promoting the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), including SDG 8 and SDG 4 (primary contribution) and SDGs 1, 5, 9, 10, 12 and 17 (secondary contributions). Overall EU policy frameworks, such as the new draft European Consensus on Development and the Joint Communication for a renewed impetus of the Africa-EU Partnership⁷, call for sustainable and inclusive economic development and support a strengthening of the role of private sectors in EU development cooperation. This is also outlined in the European Commission's Communication "*A Stronger Role of the Private Sector in Achieving Inclusive and Sustainable Growth in Developing Countries*"⁸. Finally, the action is in line with the "New Africa-Europe Alliance for Sustainable Jobs"⁹ which identifies support to skills development in Africa among its main priorities for action.

⁴ Increasing the impact of EU Development Policy: an Agenda for Change SEC(2011)1172

⁵ OJ C 210 of 30.6.2017

⁶ https://ec.europa.eu/europeaid/sites/devco/files/european-consensus-on-velopment-20170602_en

⁷ JOIN(2017)17

⁸ COM (2014) 263

⁹ President Juncker's State of the Union proposals, the Commission announced an 'Africa-Europe Alliance for Sustainable Investment and Jobs', September 2018

1.3 Public Policy Analysis of the partner country/region

The TVET sector in Botswana is currently mainly guided by the Education and Training Sector Strategic Plan 2015-2020 (ETSSP), which aims “to provide an overall policy and strategic sector framework for the education and training sector that will play a pivotal role in the development of a modern, sustainable, knowledge-based economy that supports inclusiveness and diversity”. Its underlying goals are -"access, quality, inclusion, equity, accountability and governance of the education sector.” ETSSP Sub-sector programme 6 targets TVET with the specific aim “To meet the immediate, medium and long-term skills requirements and provide an adequate supply of skilled graduates, who can also participate in the global labour markets.” It envisages to (1) attain greater accountability for a quality TVET sub-sector and meet the socio-economic needs of the country through effective governance; (2) improve the quality and relevance of the TVET system so as to produce competent TVET graduates for the needs of Botswana’s economy; (3) align TVET programmes and institutions with the demand for qualified, productive and competitive human resources, (4) produce job-ready TVET graduates through well-regulated work-based learning, including apprenticeships for both learners and trainers, (5) increased stakeholder contribution to the transformation of the TVET sector.

The ETSSP was designed and endorsed when the TVET sub-sector was under one single Ministry, the former Ministry of Education and Skills development. After the split of the Ministries, in late 2016, the plan was not revised nor did it unfold in budgeted, time bond sub-plans for each of the Ministries.

An overall TVET policy is under development but has still not been endorsed to date, there is lack of coordination in the sector as well as between the different actors involved with TVET provision. There is also a major concern regarding the fact that ETSSP expires in 2020 and so far there are no clear indications from the GoB of an extension of this Plan or a PHASE II.

From a critical analysis perspective, it is important to highlight the following:

- ETSSP has not been evaluated to date and its implementation is far from meeting the deadlines that were established. A joint annual sector review on ETSSP (including a right-based and gender approach) is crucial to monitor and evaluate the status of implementation with regard to each sub-sector and each respective strategic programme against the Key Performance Indicators. This review should be based on small sub-sector studies on key issues and should present progress and shortcomings in each sub-sector. This should ideally lead to adjustments in the annual implementation plans. The review will probably be carried out in 2019 and it should also serve as a critical information base for the continuation of ETSSP beyond 2020.
- There should be an updated and confirmed implementation schedule for the introduction of pathways at senior secondary schools that will kick-start the process. It should be highlighted that the TVET pathway will need a lot of resources and equipment to be available at the Brigades to fully implement the curriculum of the technical and vocational subjects.
- There's an absolute need for coordination between MoBE, MoTE, MELSD and the Ministry of Local Government (MLG) on TVET regarding policy (a harmonised policy for TVET has to be finalised and endorsed), infrastructure (maintenance and coordination), Pre-

service and In-service training of Teachers / Trainers / Instructors, (vertical and horizontal) articulation with National Credits and Qualifications Framework

(alignment of exit entitlements and entry-requirements of different levels within one sector, but also how to go from one sector to another at the same level), modularization and exemptions based on credits / recognition of partial qualifications (including Rapid Skills courses) and career counselling.

- An effective Governance body for TVET sub-sector must be in place as a foundation for the implementation of TVET policy and reforms, with the private sector as an integrant part of the governance system.
- Greater private sector participation in the entire education and training sector, is needed to help produce job-ready school-leavers who have the skills, knowledge and attitude for effective performance and progression in the workplace. Greater emphasis is required in schools for preparation of all learners for working life, including self-employment.
- There is a need for active engagement of the private sector and social partners on (collection and analysis of) labour market data (disaggregated at least by sex and age), skills needs analysis and planning for (long-term and short-term) remedial actions, strategic deployment of the funds generated by the Industry Levy for human resources development, the availability of temporary placement of students / apprenticeship / on-the-job training and placement services, inclusion of (part-time) instructors / assessors / moderators from the private sector in the regular provision of Education and Training as well as temporary placement of TVET teachers / trainers / instructors to refresh their work experience in the qualifications they are preparing students for.

Apart from ETSSP, it should be mentioned that the Structured Workplace Learning Regulations, replacing the Vocational Training (Structured Training) Regulations, 2008 under the repealed Vocational Training Act 1998, are still under development.

The Botswana National Human Resources Plan is being developed in order to establish demand in terms of occupations needed for Botswana's economy.

Botswana's policy framework is underpinned by National Development Plans (NDPs), with the previous NDP (NDP10, 2009-2017) aligned with the broader framework of Vision 2016, which sought to have "A prosperous, productive and innovative nation." It is recognised that there has only been modest achievement of the objectives set out in both strategies. The Government approved its Vision 2036 "Achieving prosperity for all" and the NDP 11 (2017-2023) in early 2017. NDP 11 fosters the theme "*Inclusive Growth for the Realisation of Sustainable Employment Creation and Poverty Eradication*". During NDP 10 there have been many efforts towards promoting the development of the private sector and to stimulate diversification of the economy. Despite these efforts, the impact on stimulating growth and creating employment has been rather modest. The private sector has only added on average just over 3 000 jobs per year between 2003 and 2015, well below the needs to absorb the 15 000-20 000 new arrivals on the labour market annually. Furthermore, some of the indicators relevant for the rankings under the Doing Business and Competitiveness Reports continued to drop, which had the effect of discouraging potential investors. The general trend in foreign direct investment in Botswana shows a downward movement when compared to the size of the economy – i.e. as a share of Gross Domestic Product (GDP). Apart from the peak in 2011, foreign direct investment (FDI) has declined from nearly 5 % of GDP in 2006 to only 2.5 % of GDP in 2014 – a drop of almost 50 %.

1.4 Stakeholder analysis

Education and TVET in Botswana fall under the responsibility of three ministries. The Ministry of Employment, Labour Productivity, and Skills Development (MELSD), the Ministry of Basic Education (MoBE) and the Ministry of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology (MoTE).

The MoBE is responsible for the integration of TVET at secondary level through the implementation of Multiple Pathways in Education¹⁰, allowing to reach senior secondary graduation via three alternative routes (pathways): academic, technical and professional. This ministry also has the mandate to coordinate ETSSP implementation. The multiple pathways are modularized and outcomes based and are to be implemented in the 34 senior secondary schools in three phases, running from 2019 to 2026.

The MELSD has the mandate for skills development and initial pre-tertiary TVET (artisans' level) and supervises the four certificate-level technical colleges, 37 brigades and the "rapid skills development centres": Madirelo Training and Testing Centre (MTTC) and Construction Industry Trust Fund (CITF).

The MoTE is in charge of technical education (technicians level) and supervises the four diploma-offering technical colleges and four public higher education institutions, amongst which the University of Botswana responsible for pre-service training of teachers for the TVET sector.

The Ministry of Youth Empowerment, Sports and Culture Development (MYSC) is responsible for the programmes targeting early school leavers and out of school youth.

The Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development will also be a key player on ETSSP implementation through its local economic development (LED) initiative, as well as for adequate provision of school infrastructure, equipment and nutrition of pupils for primary and junior secondary schools.

In terms of skills requirements, the education sector parastatals, namely the Human Resource Development Council (HRDC) and the Botswana Qualifications Authority (BQA), provide labour market information on various sectors and regulate the qualifications provided, respectively. The Botswana Examinations Council is taking over the assessment of TVET trainings in the future, so will also have a role to play.

The Ministry of Finance and Economic Development, which houses the National Authorising Office, is an integral element through its key role in the mobilisation and allocation of public financial resources.

For the provision of training, there are in total eight public TVET colleges in Botswana. In April 2018, the responsibilities for the Diploma-offering colleges and Certificate-offering colleges were clearly divided and allocated to the MOTE and the MELSD respectively.

¹⁰ The education pathways model, offering different routes at senior secondary level, is designed specifically to enable learners to choose and access an education type at senior secondary level that best suits their abilities and interests in their education towards graduation. It is a more inclusive education system which enables introduction of TVET learning programmes into senior secondary education curriculum.

Brigades are smaller training centres (intake capacity of approximately 200 students) that are widely spread over the country, thus allowing for access to vocational training also in rural areas. Mainly trade tests and National Craft Certificate (NCC) are delivered at the Brigades. While the Brigades enjoyed a good reputation during the first 10 to 15 years of their existence, there has been a general lack of accountability and clear responsibilities for the Brigades ever since the closure of BRIDEC (Brigades Development Centre). Later, responsibilities were not clearly defined between the former Ministry of Education and Skills Development (MoESD) and the former Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs (MLHA), now the MELSD, with its Madirelo Training and Testing Centre (MTTC).

Regarding the private sector (industry), from the onset of the programme, a network of industry stakeholders from tourism and agriculture sectors has to be established and further expanded during the lifespan of the programme. Umbrella institutions such as Business Botswana - Business Association of Employers representing employers in all sectors of the Botswana economy in an advocacy capacity – will be involved as well as the private sector organisations that already participate in the sector committees¹¹ under HRDC, mainly the tourism and the agriculture sector committees.

The private sector will participate at three levels of TVET governance: (1) policy making level, (2) institutional level, as well as (3) training delivery and assessment of TVET.

At the policy making level through the representation of partners on the governance body and consultation committee providing advice and consulting on policy issues, planning, standards, performance evaluation, quality assurance and financing

At institutional level through the coordination of TVET activities, the joint development and implementation of TVET curriculum regulate the certification of competences and frameworks for Work based learning.

At training delivery and assessment through partnerships between companies and training institutions involving local government, public and private training providers and also non-governmental organisations, to jointly define skills training needs, quality standards and performance assessments, as well as the provision of equipment, and organisation of work based learning to give trainees and trainers practical experience

The relevant sector trade unions (agriculture and tourism) also constitute important stakeholders to the programme in order to address potential risks of decent work deficits, as well as the Education Sectors trade Union.

With regard to gender, the “gender units/focal points” in the sector ministries as well as the Ministry of Nationality, Immigration and Gender Affairs will also be important stakeholders to this programme and will be involved from the inception phase of the programme.

¹¹ Sector committees bring together the leadership from various stakeholders, including government, private sector, associations, etc. and aim to inform the Human Resources Development plans addressing the misalignment between the supply of graduates and the demand for skills from the labour market.

1.5 Problem analysis/priority areas for support

The offer of skills development does not match the demand by the private sector and needs for self-employment. The high fragmentation of professions and skills, the small population and its dispersion over a large area, are factors contributing to the inadequate offer of skills in Botswana

Demand for new skills in the country include (but are not limited to): business development and management and financial literacy (to be mainstreamed in all skills development activities), leather crafting (for livestock and tourism value chains), horticultural production with improved technologies (drip irrigation and tunnels/shades), standards development and grading of horticultural products, introduction of new fruit production, small stock management, free range poultry production, marketing, community level hospitality, development of heritage and cultural tourism products, improved animal health, traceability, quality improvement, range management and livestock management also in support of a commodity based trading for the livestock value chain, game reserve development, management and marketing.

The shortcomings of the education sector have been identified in the education sector reform plan, and they are directly or indirectly related to skills for the labour market, such as for example the lack of autonomy of the training institutions, weak HR and teaching service management, and lack of capacity for efficient planning, Monitoring and Evaluation and financial management throughout the education sector. The TVET sector is fragmented and outdated, offering courses that are not relevant for the demands of the labour market, or where courses are not updated systematically, leaving gaps in the offer. The pedagogical approaches used in the classrooms are also outdated and the vocational education system does not deliver Outcome based education Curricula or assessments based on competences.

There is a general lack of entrepreneurial skills, as entrepreneurship culture is not streamlined into the mainstream education system. Many new micro-businesses fail as soon as the government funding runs out as they lack entrepreneurial skills to begin with. There is also an over-reliance on government contracts with the Government being the biggest consumer in country.

The TVET system is highly fragmented and dispersed. Currently, multiple ministries and entities are engaged in the provision of various TVET programmes:

- the Ministry of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology supervises the vocational training colleges (VTCs) and has its own Quality Assurance and Assessment unit (QAA) independent from the Botswana Qualifications Authority (BQA), which means they undergo two quality assurance systems;
- the Ministry of Employment, Labour Productivity and Skills Development supervises brigades;
- the Ministry of Basic Education is implementing the Multiple Pathways in Education that encompass TVET integration in Senior Secondary Schools;
- Private TVET institutions are registered at the BQA;
- The Ministry of Youth, Sports and Culture manages internships and industrial attachment programmes for TVET students and graduates;
- The Human Resources Development Council (HRDC) has been working to establish a labour market observatory to capture labour market information and intelligence in a

comprehensive, gender sensitive and harmonised manner and is responsible for the sector committees that should bring together the demand and supply sides of TVET ;

- The Botswana Examination Council (BEC) manages the information of examinations;
- The Department of Information Technology (DIT) supervises various public information systems which contain TVET-related data and information; and other line ministries, parastatal bodies and various private institutions may also provide their own training programs.

While Education related Ministries discuss regularly, there is no formal mechanism to coordinate all of these different types of TVET programs in Botswana.

Concerning gender, while Botswana has a parity index of 1.11 when it comes to gross enrolment of primary and secondary, the same cannot be ascertained of TVET enrolment. There are TVET participation rates which indicate male-female enrolment but they are not disaggregated according to trades so a high participation rate for female might mean that many females are enrolled in female-stereotyped trades like business studies, secretarial and dressmaking. The lack of a gender perspective either in collecting administrative data or programme information prevents a more pronounced understanding of where women are located in TVET and the environment they need to learn and work in.

1.6 Other areas of assessment

1.6.1 *Fundamental values*

Botswana has a long-standing multiparty constitutional democracy and generally, free and fair elections are held every five years. Term limits for the President (two terms) are strictly adhered to. The Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) has been the ruling party since independence. Although separation of powers is sufficient, legislative oversight is weak and more resources are necessary to support the standing Committees of the Parliament. Capacities of the civil society and media organisations to act as a watchdog or an advocate for societal change are limited, and this role should be reinforced.

The Constitution and law provide for an independent judiciary, and this generally functions well. Access to justice is considered satisfactory in Botswana, although legal advice may not be affordable to all. In the 2017 Ibrahim Index of African Governance, Botswana scores 92.8 on the sub-category Rule of Law, with a deteriorating trend mainly due to a significant deterioration in the indicator relating to judicial independence. Police and law enforcement are generally not considered as major human rights challenges. The Botswana police forces have recently been ranked first in Africa by the World Internal Security and Police Index.

Botswana has a low rate of ratification of international and regional human rights legislation. The UN Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Convention on the Rights of People with Disabilities, Convention on Protection of the Rights of Migrant Workers, as well as most AU Human Rights legislation still need to be ratified. While in some cases, Botswana's reluctance to ratify has objective reasons, in many cases ratification and domestication is a capacity problem. It is worth noting that the Convention on the Rights of the Child has been fully integrated into national legislation. Botswana has also ratified the revised Southern Africa Development Community (SADC) Gender Protocol in 2017.

Gender-based violence as well as child labour remains a problem. The Botswana GBV Indicators Study Research Report shows that 67.3 % of women have experienced some form of gender-based violence in their lifetime.

In general, Botswana has a credible legal framework guaranteeing fundamental freedoms and human rights. However, Botswana retains capital punishment for murder and treason.

Another issue is LGBTI rights, as homosexual acts are still criminalised, though rarely prosecuted. The main changes continue to come from the courts. Stigmatization is known to prevent access to services (health, police, etc.) in some cases. On freedom of speech, in the 2017 World Press Freedom Index, Botswana continued its downward trend and dropped 5 places to 48 out of 180 countries in the World.

In the international arena, Botswana has been a staunch supporter of human rights everywhere, supporting the Internal Criminal Court and speaking out against dictatorial rulers.

1.6.2 *Macroeconomic policy*

According to the last International Monetary Fund (IMF) Article IV Review released on 5 September 2018, the economy is expected to recover in 2018 with around 4.6 % economic growth thanks to higher diamond sales, a stable macroeconomic framework and large increase of government spending as reflected in the 2018/2019 Budget Speech. Despite this domestic positive outlook, the fiscal situation will remain tight with an expected fiscal deficit of 3-4% of Gross domestic product (GDP) owing to lower Southern African Customs Union revenues

and higher recurrent outlays, which should be manageable given the high levels of savings, low debt and foreign exchange reserves which account for 13.2 months of imports as of December 2017. The IMF also points out the need to rationalise parastatals, some being inefficient or with overlapping mandates, and privatise key enterprises. For some of them, concerns persist with regard to their financial situation and weak management.

The inflation rate remained stable at 3.1 % in July 2018, near the lower band of the Bank of Botswana target range. Monetary policy was and remains accommodative and sound. According to the recent IMF Article IV visit, the financial sector is well-capitalised and soundly managed. The level of the debt in 2017 at 19 % continued to be low and far below the statutory limit of 40 %.

During its last visit, the IMF insisted on the need to strengthen efforts towards economic diversification to maximise the benefits from the favourable prospects in the years to come. The current economic development model based on diamond production and government-led system has shown its limits notably in terms of job creation, economic diversification and private sector development.

However, this is assuming a prompt implementation of structural reforms on the revenue and expenditure sides to gradually return to fiscal surpluses, coupled with reducing labour market rigidities, strengthening skills and implementing market-friendly reforms, all with the view of boosting private sector development and impacting effectively on job creation, reduction of inequality and export diversification. In this context, domestic revenue mobilisation (reduction of tax arrears and tax exemptions, enlargement of property tax) will be crucial together with measures to contain the growth of recurrent spending, improve the efficiency of social programmes and protect public investments on the expenditure side. A less favourable scenario would ensue should the reforms be delayed or weakly implemented.

Macroeconomic policies implemented by the government continue to be prudent and are expected to remain appropriate in medium term. The government is strongly committed to fiscal consolidation and foresees a fiscal surplus as from Financial Year 2020/2021. The 11th National Development Plan launched in April 2017 emphasizes the importance of improving the ease of doing business notably to reduce the cost and the administrative burden of doing business. The 2018/2019 Budget Speech reiterates the importance to create space for the private sector to play its role as an engine of diversified growth and main source of employment going forward. Such reforms will be necessary to achieve the 2036 Vision of the country to become a "destination of choice for investment".

1.6.3 Public Financial Management (PFM)

A number of PFM reforms have been undertaken in Botswana recently notably with the passage of a number of important pieces of legislation such as the PFM Act 2011 and Public Audit Act 2012. Important improvements have been made notably in the area of macro/fiscal planning, public investment management and external audit. Reforms of the Internal Audit and ease of paying taxes have been completed recently.

The 2013 Public Expenditure Financial Accountability assessment concludes that Botswana PFM system is fundamentally sound and well functioning. Aggregate fiscal discipline is maintained whilst some aspects such as revenue forecasting or information available on expenditures of extra-budgetary entities reveal some deficiencies. Resource allocation is

efficient as supported by the Medium Term Fiscal Framework and the Medium Term Expenditure Framework albeit subject to too many in-year reallocations which undermines the government's ability to use the budget as a strategic resource allocation mechanism. Service delivery is also efficient although improvements are necessary in public procurement, supervision of statutory bodies and timely information of grant information to the Local Authorities.

That being said, the pace of implementation over the past two years has been slower than initially planned in some areas for several reasons including lack of capacities and inaccurate timing estimation of the reforms implementation. Some activities have been carried over to the following financial year several times. Some of the reforms have been acknowledged as being rather medium-term to long-term reforms which reflects the over-ambition of the PFM Reform Programme notably in terms of timing and explains the delays in implementation.

The Delegation considers the PFM Reform Programme sufficiently relevant and credible. The structure of the Reform Programme has improved over time through successive revisions of the components of the programme and streamlining of the number of activities as well as by creating a new component on Parliament Oversight, separate from the External Audit, which was recommended in previous assessments. The political buy-in is evident and the government remains committed to pursue necessary and relevant PFM reforms. This is based on the Public Investment Management Assessment (PIMA) assessment conducted last year and it will be reflected in the PEFA launched in January 2019.

The 2019 PEFA will be the first comprehensive PEFA using the new framework. Together with the PIMA, these assessments will inform the revision of the PFM Reform Strategy expected in 2019. Botswana is also considering the conduct of a Debt Management Performance Assessment (DEMPA) and preparatory training has already taken place. The Government is carrying out a Public Expenditure Review (PER) of the education sector with the assistance of the World Bank and UNICEF. This will be a useful instrument to better understand inefficiencies and gaps in the sector which could be addressed through the programme.

In the area of Domestic Revenue Mobilisation, a new Customs Management System (CMS), has been implemented since January 2017 and the government is working on acquiring a modern web based Tax Management and Revenue Collection System (TMRCS) to replace the current system. E-services such as e-filing and e-payment of all tax returns, online application and verification of Tax Clearance Certificates and online registration for tax purposes have been completed in order to improve the ease of paying taxes. Several events to educate taxpayers and improve voluntary tax compliance have been conducted. More reforms would be necessary to enlarge the tax base and improve tax collection efficiency. The Tax Administration bill is yet to be presented to Parliament and will open the door to the revision of other pieces of legislation such as the VAT Act and the Income Tax Act.

Close attention should be given to addressing international tax issues following the identification of Botswana as potential non-cooperative jurisdictions for tax purposes and high risk jurisdiction with Anti-Money Laundering/Counter-Terrorist Financing (AML/CTF) deficiencies.

1.6.4 Transparency and oversight of the budget

The Financial Year in Botswana runs from April to March. The Ministry of Finance and Economic Development presents the Executive's Budget Proposal every year at the beginning of February, ahead of the Financial Year. In his Speech, the Minister sets out the macroeconomic and fiscal review and outlook and details the fiscal implication of the proposed policies. The Executive Budget's Proposal is usually published end of March once the Budget has been enacted on the official Ministry and Government portal websites together with the Appropriation Act. The Citizens' Budget is prepared and published in Setswana as well as in Braille as reported by the Government, which provides a satisfactory engagement of government finances at grass-root level. A "Budget in brief" and "People's Guide to the Budget" are also prepared and published online. The pre-budget statements are not published, neither are the in-year and mid-year reports.

The last Open Budget Index report has registered a substantial decline in the score for Botswana from 50/100 in 2015 to 8/100 in the 2017 report, mainly due to the combined effect of a change in definition of "publicly available" by International Budget Partnership (IBP) and serious IT problems faced by the Government since 2017. The IT issues have been resolved recently and all budget documents have been available on the official Ministry of Finance website since October 2018. It is expected that the government will ensure accessibility of the website and the documents in the future.

Audit reports are produced annually and submitted to Parliament although systemically with delays of about one to two months. The Annual Statements of Account are submitted on time to the Auditor General, within 6 months after the end of the Fiscal Year. The coverage of the audit report is satisfactory albeit not comprehensive notably at local level. In 2016, the auditor general had received Annual Statements of Account for 10 local councils out of 16.

An informal working group on Budget Transparency initiated by Development Partners which gathers key stakeholders on the Government and Development Partners side has been set up and meets on a quarterly basis. The government is looking at formalising this platform of dialogue and at closely involving the civil society in this process of formalisation of the dialogue on transparency and accountability.

Despite the recent IT challenges faced by the country, budget transparency and budget oversight remain satisfactory although aspects above provide room for improvement and policy dialogue remains important. The formalisation of the existing informal dialogue platform would create a good momentum by providing the adequate platform for dialogue and efficient monitoring of progress accomplished.

2 RISKS AND ASSUMPTIONS

In relation with the implementation modality as Sector Budget Support, and in line with the analysis carried out through the Risk Management Framework (RMF), the main identified risks are linked to the developmental efficiency of the government as outlined in the table below.

Risks	Risk level (H/M/L)	Mitigating measures

Limited ownership, lack of adequate commitment, low capacities and inadequate resources by key government institutions.	M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Institutional assessment of key partners and definition of capacity development strategy and plan to bridge gaps; • A sound and inclusive governance structure, with key role of the private sector associations and presence of the EUD, which will meet on a regular basis, to ensure commitment and ownership throughout implementation; • Effective monitoring and evaluation arrangements measuring achievement of key results (including impact on human rights and contribution to gender equality); • Close linkages with NSO and PO for political leadership, providing full support for TVET Sector Reform Programme implementation; • TA support and dialogue provided at Minister, PS and Directors' level, building mutual trust with interested institutions.
Limited capacities/empowerment by private sector organisations to advocate for policy reforms.	H	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Awareness building and strengthening capacity of policy dialogue; • Awareness building and strengthening of the government to deal with questions related to human rights, gender and business (regulations, systems, implementation, monitoring mechanisms); • Strengthening Private Sector organisations for ownership, commitment and accountability; • Strengthening dialogue across organisations; • Operationalize existing M&E mechanisms and enable M&E analysis.
Public policy will not lead to the achievement of agreed development results	H	Complementary measures will aim at reinforcing the capacities in the sector for better policy design and implementation targeting the linkages between policy objectives, budget, planning and implementation, and M&E.
Sector capacity constraints will severely constrain the achievement of sector results	H	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The institutionalization of the sector coordination and the definition and operationalization of a governance model for the TVET will support addressing the weak implementation capacity of the sector; <p>Structured policy dialogue together with technical assistance for capacity building of relevant services will enhance the attainment of results.</p>
Weaknesses in statistical system (accuracy, timeliness, independence, etc.) significantly put in question the validity of	H	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Technical assistance will support data collection and aggregation of the relevant sector ministries; • Joint actions with other development partners, such as the World Bank and the UN.

policy design, monitoring and results		
Assumptions		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Government of Botswana will commit to the TVET Sector Reform Programme agenda, to a specific roadmap with well-defined benchmarks and targets, particularly for policies and strategies related to TVET governance. • Regular high level dialogue between the GoB and the EU is maintained with focus on issues of TVET Sector Reform. • The GoB maintains its commitment to the implementation of the education sector strategic plan 2015-2020, and set up coordination mechanisms among the sector ministries for its implementation and supervision. 		

3 LESSONS LEARNT AND COMPLEMENTARITY

3.1 Lessons learnt

The TVET Sector Reform Programme formulation builds on learning experiences from EU Cooperation in Botswana (including the 10th EDF Education Budget Support, *Private Sector Development Programme* and TVET) as well as from experiences from national programmes and development partners, taking into account the following lessons:

- Previous private sector development (PSD) and skills development programmes, designed without a comprehensive policy reform agenda, proved to have a limited effectiveness (*lesson from Private Sector Development Programme (PSDP) financed by the EU and TVET-I*);
- Institutions need to establish a culture of efficiency, work ethics, management by results and client orientation;
- Monitoring and evaluation should be strengthened at all levels for accountability, lesson learning and management by results.

Linkages with the Education regions within the country should be enhanced during programme implementation to guarantee appropriation and attainment of the targets.

The conclusions of the mission financed under the VET toolbox facility will also be taken in consideration, specially those contained in the analysis of the TVET Governance in Botswana and the rapid labour market assessment of the tourism value chain.

3.2 Complementarity, synergy and donor coordination

Although there are few providers of external assistance remaining in Botswana, due to its status as an Upper-Middle Income Country, TVET Sector Reform Programme formulation has identified several opportunities to build complementarities, synergies and donor coordination:

- GIZ has been implementing the SER TVET programme (a tripartite partnership between Government of Botswana (GoB) / Ministry of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology (MoTE), Botswana Chamber of Mines (BCM) and German Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) – targeting mainly the mining sector. This programme was extended and ended in August 2018. The current GIZ programme (SER TVET II), also targeting TVET has been developed under a common EU – German

cooperation approach which outlines the focus of the intervention on the capacity development of critical target groups and institutions, at different levels with particular attention to strengthening the industry demand orientation of the TVET system. This programme is looking at the systemic integration of instruments and approaches aimed at improved demand-oriented TVET programmes and temporary work-placements of TVET staff which would enhance employability;

- Synergies should also be established with the interventions planned under the 11th EDF EU-Botswana Dialogue and Cooperation Facility;
- The World Bank (WB) supported the setup of the Labour Market Observatory under the Human Resources Development Council (HRDC) with a study on the feasibility of the Labour market observatory. The WB together with UNICEF will launch, during the last quarter of 2018, a Public Expenditure Review on Education. UNESCO is operating at regional level (SADC) on issues regarding Work Based Learning (WBL). So far, no project is being implemented. The work has been developed at the technical committee's level on the development of regional frameworks, namely the SADC TVET Strategic Framework and Programme of Action 2018-2027. South Korea is supporting Botswana in the areas of assessment and quality assurance;
- The skills development component will build on the lessons and results of the Better Education for Africa's rise I and II (BEAR) project implemented by UNESCO, involved in two technical colleges focusing on training in the hospitality sector and on improving information management systems (EMIS) for TVET.

4 DESCRIPTION OF THE ACTION

4.1 Overall objective, specific objective(s), expected outputs and indicative activities

The **overall objective** of the programme is to contribute to unemployment reduction, especially among the youth.

The **Specific objective** is to increase the availability of TVET graduates including women, men and minority ethnic groups with labour market relevant skills.

The results (**induced outputs**) of the programme, in line with the TVET sector policies and strategies, are:

IO1: Strengthened governance and accountability of the Education/TVET sector.

IO2: Improved quality and relevance of TVET Programmes.

IO3: Provision of gender sensitive work based learning opportunities.

The **Direct Outputs** are the following:

DO1: Additional fiscal space created by the transfer of funds and increased predictability of funds.

DO2: Improved policy dialogue and reduced transaction costs.

DO3: Strengthened capacities conducive to the implementation of TVET Policy and ETSSP.

DO4: Improved coordination, monitoring and reporting of reforms.

Main Activities:

Budget support

Result 1: Strengthened governance and accountability of the Education/TVET sector

A coordination structure for the implementation of the Education and Training Sector Strategic Plan (ETSSP) will be institutionalised with clear lines of responsibility and reporting requirements clearly defined to enable the different institutions to deliver their mandate in a coordinated manner and guaranty alignment in the sector especially between TVET sub-sector and the formal education system.

A governance model will be proposed, developed and implemented with a view to facilitate dialogues among the key entities on ETSSP and TVET and the most relevant stakeholders. This will include the following aspects:

- a. the design and implementation of a procedure for regular public-private dialogue and consultation at TVET policy and strategic decision levels;
- b. advice and capacity building in order to strengthen the three education ministries involved in ETSSP and TVET (Ministry of Basic Education, Ministry of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology and Ministry of Employment, Labour Productivity and Skills Development) in core functions.

This will help to have employment relevant TVET and improved planning, budgeting, research, monitoring and evaluation. In parallel, medium-term efforts to restructure the TVET sector will continue in order to simplify the sector organisational set-up and reduce transaction costs. A governance model involving multiple stakeholders and targeting different levels of the TVET system will be defined and put in place establishing clear hierarchical lines amongst the ministries, defining, which is ultimately responsible for the overall coordination, oversight and assessment of the TVET policy implementation and reporting.

Result 2: Improved quality and relevance of TVET Programmes

The activities include developing and implementing Education Multiple Pathways (academic, technical and professional) in senior secondary education; develop and integrate identified priority Vocational Programmes into Multiple Pathways Learning Programmes; transforming TVET teachers training (outcome based, action oriented); capacitating and supporting implementing structures, such as BEC, BQA and HRDC; supporting further development of appropriate Assessment of vocational competence (at schools, brigades, of apprenticeships, and as national assessment); capacity building for managers of TVET training providers on institutional planning, finance, internal monitoring and evaluation (including tracer studies); supporting the development of links with the private sector for on-the job training and internships for students/trainees and teachers/trainers attachments; in-company instructors training; support professional development of teachers/lecturers at Senior Secondary Schools, Technical Colleges and Brigades to deliver the new programmes (in-service training); capacitate and support TVET staff to develop and deliver new curricula, learning material and assessments for the new programmes. New curricula and learning materials will target, among others, technical competencies for sustainable tourism and agriculture, with focus on management of environmental safeguards and handling of Occupational Health and Safety and the application of green technology (green growth).

Result 3: Provision of gender sensitive work based learning opportunities

Students' professional practices will be organized in close cooperation with private sector companies in order to improve the employability of the graduates from the technical courses,

especially women which rate higher amongst the unemployed Youth. Partnerships with the private sector will be supported to universalise the practice of Work based learning (WBL) in the offer of technical training. In order to attain this result, partnership agreements between training providers and private sector companies will be revised and new ones will be forged; work based learning coordinators will be appointed and capacitated; work based learning programmes will be drafted based on competences and skills ensuring relevance and monitoring functions will be enhanced. An analysis of the obstacles preventing women to participate in WBL will be performed as well as needs analysis of companies in order to provide adequate and relevant experiences.

Complementary support

Complementary support will be for the technical assistance required to support the implementation of the TVET Policy and ETSSP. The support will be done through indirect management with a member state, GIZ, by means of a Contribution Agreement. The allocation of the complementary support will be Euro 2 700 000.

The Technical Assistance should support, inter alia, in the: (i) development of specialized curricula in the areas selected as priorities in Government plans, (ii) implementation of approaches and tools for demand-oriented TVET at vocational training institutions, (iii) improve monitoring and coordination mechanisms among relevant stakeholders, (iv) set-up national assessments of TVET trainees and training of the assessors, (v) integrations of new programmes on National Credit and Qualifications Framework, (vi) support dialogue amongst Government institutions engaged in ETSSP implementation, facilitate dialogue between relevant stakeholders and provide advice and capacity building for the three education ministries; (vii) strengthen private sector organizations for ownership, commitment and accountability, support the development of links with private sector for work based learning opportunities; support the establishment of partnerships with the private sector.

4.2 Intervention Logic

As part of a comprehensive approach to address economic diversification in Botswana, the entire 11th EDF NIP has been designed to support inclusive and sustainable growth and promote employment creation, and specifically this project is being formulated to support TVET policy and reforms and the provision of sustainable and market-oriented competences and skills. This action will contribute to increase the availability of TVET graduates including women, men and minority ethnic groups with labour market relevant skills, through three mutually reinforcing results (1) Strengthened governance and accountability of the Education/TVET sector; (2) Improved quality and relevance of TVET Programmes; (3) Provision of Gender sensitive work based learning opportunities.

A sector reform performance contract (SRPC) is considered as the appropriate implementation modality for this programme, given its focus on supporting policy development and reforms, improving governance and service delivery of the Education/TVET sector. Additionally to the funding (transfer of funds to the national treasury) that may translate in additional budgetary financial resources to the TVET sector specifically, the combination of improved policy dialogue, leveraged by the monitoring of performance indicators and disbursement conditions, as well the provision of technical assistance to the relevant actors in the TVET sector will translate in direct outputs that will clearly strengthen the capacities of the government to attain the envisaged results (induced outputs) .

The underlying cause of poor sector performance is the lack of sector coordination and huge fragmentation that characterizes it together with the recognized inability of GoB to implement policies and plans. To date the governance is understood as a completely government led process, with no efficient monitoring and evaluation systems put in place. These challenges will be targeted by the activities under result 1, namely the support to define and operationalize a governance model for the sector enabling better coordination amongst the different actors and better accountability for the implementation of the reforms bringing together different stakeholders to participate in the process, amongst which the private sector.

The involvement and partnership with the private sector will be determinant to ensure the relevance of TVET to economic diversification and to the development process. The project will foster the effective and sustainable involvement of the private sector in implementing TVET policy and reforms (governance, monitoring, evaluation and quality assurance), in the entire training cycle (needs assessment, curriculum development) and in the provision of work place learning opportunities for TVET graduates (internships, apprenticeships, scholarships).

The reasoning is that by ensuring an active role for the private sector, TVET will become more demand driven and match the needs of the economy.

Regarding the quality and relevance of the training provided, the programme will support the implementation and roll-out of multiple pathways in education, that foresee the introduction of TVET in senior secondary education (presently TVET is not fully integrated in the education sector and does not allow for vertical or horizontal mobility of learners). By supporting the development of learning programs for the technical and professional pathways (curriculum development and accreditation) with the participation of the private sector (industry), as well as the training of teachers to deliver the new curriculum (modularized outcomes based curriculum) and the preparation of assessments and assessors for the national examinations there will be a clear contribution to achieve a comprehensive and aligned TVET system with higher quality and relevance to the economy. Partnerships with the private sector will also be supported to guarantee that the practical training foreseen in the training programmes actually takes place in a work environment.

In conformity with the Government phase I roll-out plan for the introduction of multiple pathways in education two sectors will be initially targeted: agriculture and tourism.

Agriculture and tourism – both sectors based on natural and sustainable resources – are the second and third source of revenues in the country. Within agriculture, livestock is a widespread activity, and represents the main source of livelihood for the target group. Opportunities are linked to significant production potential and well-established markets. There are no further sectors in sight offering such opportunities for bettering the Botswana national balance of trade. Nevertheless, other programme areas may be supported during the life span of the programme in alignment with government priorities and roll-out plans.

Sector trade unions as well as civil society organizations will also play an important role as regulators of the system, demanding for greater accountability.

In order to provide opportunities for women, the gender dimension will be specifically targeted by result 3 and will be mainstreamed in the other two results.

To this end, a gender analysis will be performed during the inception phase of the programme to get in-depth information about the needs, obstacles and opportunities of the women and

different minority ethnic groups in accessing training and graduating, and the implementation of approaches and tools for demand-oriented and gender-sensitive TVET will take place.

According to the Gender Profile 2016, in TVET there is still a bias towards boys as most of the programmes have been offered for a long time in traditionally male-dominated trades. Therefore, this programme should be based on a gender analysis to encourage and facilitate women's participation in all areas of training and in all activities of the programme. In this sense it will be key to also monitor the sectors in order to avoid that women remain in the most "traditional ones".

Complementary support through technical assistance to the actors involved in TVET will target activities and capacity building under the three result areas.

4.3 Mainstreaming

The intention of the Programme is to address gender, youth and environment (green growth) as priority key crosscutting issues.

Women's empowerment and gender equality is mainstreamed in the TVET Sector Reform Programme design, specifically supported by dedicated results and activities through: i) national strategies, policies, legislation, regulations improved for strengthening the role of women and youth ii) developing capacities for active participation by women and youth, particularly at entrepreneurial levels; entrepreneurship support for women and youth and strengthening the gender focus of the skills development component, and providing dedicated technical assistance services.

While Botswana has a parity index of 1.11 when it comes to gross enrolment of primary and secondary, the same cannot be ascertained of TVET enrolment. There are TVET participation rates which indicate male-female enrolment but they are not disaggregated according to trades so a high participation rate for female might mean that many females are enrolled in female-stereotyped trades like business studies, secretarial and dressmaking. The lack of a gender perspective either in collecting administrative data or programme information prevents a more pronounced understanding of where women are located in TVET and the environment they need to learn and work in. A communication campaign to counter prejudice against TVET in Botswana will be launched January 2019 for a period of 24 months. This campaign will address among other elements women in TVET and promote the role of women in trades usually dominated by men.

The promotion of equity and gender equality through the TVET system is one of the main results under Result area 3. Furthermore, rehabilitation and equipment of schools and brigades for the implementation of multiple pathways and vocational education and training will be done ensuring that the rehabilitated structures include all the necessary facilities for girls (hostels, latrines, etc.) and other vulnerable groups.

TVET training linked with agriculture, processing and manufacturing, and tourism sectors will include a focus on capacity-building of tools promoting green economy and mitigation/adaptation to climate change. Among others, new curricula will include focus on good agricultural practices benefiting soil quality and biodiversity, and promote climate smart farming and livestock range. Training on processing and manufacturing will also address management of green technology and implementation of environment and safety standards. Training on eco-tourism and low-carbon tourism will be linked with better waste and water management, protection of habitats and wild life, and climate change mitigation.

The HIV/AIDS pandemic and maternal mortality remains a major challenge for Botswana. Although some progress has been made, there are still issues that can be hindering access to education/TVET and employment. These will be analysed and specific interventions targeting these challenges could be supported under this programme.

4.4 Contribution to SDGs

This intervention is relevant for the United Nations 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. It contributes primarily to the progressive achievement of SDGs 4 –“Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all”, 8 -"Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all" and 5 - "Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls"., while also contributing to SDG 1 "End poverty in all its forms everywhere"; SDG 2 "End hunger; achieve food security and improved nutrition and sustainable agriculture". The crosscutting support to good sector governance, participatory policy definition and strengthened institutions also contribute to SDG 10 “Reduce inequality within and among countries”; SDG 12, “Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns” and SDG 17 (target 17.7) to “encourage and promote effective public-private, and civil society partnerships”.

Botswana has established country specific SDGs targets¹², out of which the following are worth highlighting in the context of this programme.

For SDG 4:

- By 2030, ensure equal access for all women and men to affordable and quality technical, vocational and tertiary education, including university
- By 2030, substantially increase the number of youth and adults who have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship

For SDG8:

- By 2020, substantially reduce the proportion of youth not in employment, education or training
- By 2030, devise and implement policies to promote sustainable tourism that creates jobs and promotes local culture and products

For SDG 5: End all forms of discrimination against all women and girls everywhere

5 IMPLEMENTATION

5.1 Financing agreement

In order to implement this action, it is foreseen to conclude a financing agreement with the partner country.

5.2 Indicative implementation period

The indicative operational implementation period of this action, during which the activities described in section 4 will be carried out and the corresponding contracts and agreements implemented, is 48 months from the date of entry into force of the financing agreement.

¹² Stats Brief (2018), *Botswana Domesticated Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) Indicator Framework*, funded by the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), <http://www.statsbots.org.bw>

Extensions of the implementation period may be agreed by the Commission's responsible authorising officer by amending this Decision and the relevant contracts and agreements.

5.3 Implementation of the budget support component

5.3.1 Rationale for the amounts allocated to budget support

The amount allocated for budget support component is EUR 10 000 000, and for complementary support is EUR 2 700 000 and EUR 300 000 for evaluation and audits. This amount is based on the activities foreseen in accomplishing the targets for the indicators under this programme.

5.3.2 Criteria for disbursement of budget support

a) The general conditions for disbursement of all tranches are as follows:

- Satisfactory progress in the implementation of the Education and Training Sector Strategic Plan (ETSSP), in particular ETSSP Sub-sector programme 6 – Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET and Skills Sub sector and continued credibility and relevance thereof;
- Maintenance of a credible and relevant stability-oriented macroeconomic policy or progress made towards restoring key balances;
- Satisfactory progress in the implementation of reforms to improve public financial management, including domestic revenue mobilisation, and continued relevance and credibility of the reform programme;
- Satisfactory progress with regard to the public availability of timely, comprehensive and sound budgetary information.

b) The performance indicators for disbursement that may be used for variable tranches are the following:

- ETSSP coordination is institutionalized and operational across the relevant Ministries
- TVET governance body is institutionalized and operational with participation of relevant public stakeholders and the private sector
- Status of implementation of the roll-out plan for Multiple pathways
- Number of in-service trained teachers to deliver Multiple Pathways programmes
- Number of new learning programmes developed with the participation of the private sector, aligned to the NQF and accredited
- Percentage of women attending the last year of technical training that are following work-based learning in a private company

The chosen performance indicators and targets to be used for disbursements will apply for the duration of the action. However, in duly justified circumstances, Ministry of Finance and Economic Development may submit a request to the Commission for the targets and indicators to be changed. Note that any change to the targets should be agreed ex-ante at the latest by the end of the first quarter of the assessed year. The agreed changes to the targets and indicators shall be agreed in advance and may be authorised in writing (either through a formal amendment to the financing agreement or an exchange of letters).

In case of a significant deterioration of fundamental values, budget support disbursements may be suspended, reduced or cancelled, in accordance with the relevant provisions of the financing agreement.

5.3.3 Budget support details

Summary of disbursement for fixed and variable tranches:

Tranche	2019	2020	2021	2022
Fixed	2 million (100%)		0	0
Variable		2 million (100%)	3 million (100%)	3 million (100%)
Total	2 million	2 million	3 million	3 million

Budget support is provided as direct untargeted budget support to the national treasury. The crediting of the euro transfers disbursed into Botswana Pula will be undertaken at the appropriate exchange rates in line with the relevant provisions of the financing agreement.

5.4 Implementation modalities for complementary support to budget support

The Commission will ensure that the EU appropriate rules and procedures for providing financing to third parties are respected, including review procedures, where appropriate, and compliance of the action with EU restrictive measures¹³.

5.4.1 Indirect management with a Member State Organisation

A part of this action may be implemented in indirect management with GIZ. This implementation entails technical assistance required to support implementation of the TVET Policy and ETSSP, namely the activities described in section 4.1 of this document. The envisaged entity has been selected due to its comparative advantage based on its longstanding engagement with Botswana in supporting the TVET sub-sector.

5.5 Scope of geographical eligibility for procurement and grants

The geographical eligibility in terms of place of establishment for participating in procurement and grant award procedures and in terms of origin of supplies purchased as established in the basic act and set out in the relevant contractual documents shall apply.

The Commission's authorising officer responsible may extend the geographical eligibility on the basis of urgency or of unavailability of products and services in the markets of the countries concerned, or in other duly substantiated cases where the eligibility rules would make the realisation of this action impossible or exceedingly difficult.

5.6 Indicative budget

	EU contribution (in EUR)	Indicative third party contribution, in currency identified
5.3. Sector Reform Contract	10 000 000	
5.4. – Complementary measures		
5.4.1. – Indirect management	2 700 000	

¹³ www.sanctionsmap.eu Please note that the sanctions map is an IT tool for identifying the sanctions regimes. The source of the sanctions stems from legal acts published in the Official Journal (OJ). In case of discrepancy between the published legal acts and the updates on the website it is the OJ version that prevails.

with GIZ (including Communication and visibility)		
5.9 – Evaluation, 5.10 - Audit	300 000	N.A.
Contingencies ¹⁴	0	N.A.
Totals	13 000 000	

5.7 Organisational set-up and responsibilities

The implementation of the Action involves the following stakeholders /organisational set up, both for the budget support component and for the complementary measures:

- The National Authorising Officer is the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development (MFED) and will act as the Contracting Authority for procurements and grant procedures;
- The Delegation of the European Union will control ex ante procurement and grant procedures; it will oversee and execute payments; including procedures carried out by GIZ;
- For the skills development component institutional coordination will draw membership from the Ministry of Employment, Labour, Productivity and Skills Development, the Ministry of Basic Education and the Ministry of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology. The latter is responsible for coordinating the TVET reforms.

A **steering committee** shall be set up to oversee the overall direction and policy of the programme. It will meet every six months. It will be co-chaired by the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development and the EU. The composition will also include:

- The National Authorising Officer is the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development (MFED);
- Ministry of Employment, Labour, Productivity and Skills Development;
- Ministry of Basic Education;
- Ministry of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology;
- GIZ

A Technical committee shall be set up to follow up the technical and operational implementation of the programme. It will meet every two months. It will be co-chaired by the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development and the EU. The composition will include:

- The National Authorising Officer is the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development (MFED);
- Ministry of Employment, Labour, Productivity and Skills Development;
- Ministry of Basic Education;
- Ministry of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology;
- Ministry of Local Government (MLG)
- Ministry of Nationality, Immigration and Gender affairs

¹⁴ Consider that contracts where no financing agreement is concluded, contingencies have to be covered by individual and legal commitments by 31 December of N+1.

- GIZ;
- Parastatals: BQA, BEC, HRDC
- Business Botswana

5.8 Performance and Results monitoring and reporting

The day-to-day technical and financial monitoring of the implementation of this action will be a continuous process, and part of the implementing partner's responsibilities. To this aim, the implementing partner shall establish a permanent internal, technical and financial monitoring system for the action and elaborate regular progress reports (not less than annual) and final reports. Every report shall provide an accurate account of implementation of the action, difficulties encountered, changes introduced, as well as the degree of achievement of its results (induced outputs and direct outcomes) as measured by corresponding indicators, using as reference the Logframe matrix (for the Contribution Agreement with GIZ) and the partner's strategy, policy or reform action plan list (for budget support).

Given the fact that some baselines and targets are not available, there is a need for specific baseline studies to be conducted. The Technical assistance to ETSSP implementation, funded under the Technical Cooperation Facility, to bridge the gap between the 10th EDF programme and the 11th EDF programme will assist on the elaboration of the monitoring performance framework for the programme. An end line study will also be conducted after completion of the programme.

From year two of the programme the Government is expected to release a Joint Annual Education Sector Review, including the TVET sub-sector and using a gender sensitive approach. This is a comprehensive report on all the programmes of the Education/TVET sector providing information on the level of implementation at three levels: providers of services, regional structures and Ministries. To the extent possible the data will be sex, age and sector disaggregated.

A concept note on Joint Annual sector review has been finalised but the criteria for a performance assessment of this review are still to be defined.

SDGs indicators and, if applicable, any jointly agreed indicators as for instance per Joint Programming document should be taken into account.

The report shall be laid out in such a way as to allow monitoring of the means envisaged and employed and of the budget details for the action. The final report, narrative and financial, will cover the entire period of the action implementation.

The Commission may undertake additional project monitoring visits both through its own staff and through independent consultants recruited directly by the Commission for independent monitoring reviews (or recruited by the responsible agent contracted by the Commission for implementing such reviews).

5.9 Evaluation

Having regard to the importance of the action, a mid-term and ex-post evaluations will be carried out for this action or its components via independent consultants contracted by the Commission.

The mid-term evaluation will be carried out for problem solving and learning purposes, in particular with respect to the intention to launch a second phase of the action, etc.

The ex-post evaluation will be carried out for accountability and learning purposes at various levels (including for policy revision), taking into account in particular the fact that new processes of governing the sector will be put in place together with mechanisms to guarantee private sector involvement.

The evaluation of this action may be performed individually or through a joint strategic evaluation of budget support operations carried out with the partner country, other budget support providers and relevant stakeholders.

The Commission shall inform the implementing partner at least 30 in advance of the dates foreseen for the evaluation missions. The implementing partner shall collaborate efficiently and effectively with the evaluation experts, and inter alia provide them with all necessary information and documentation, as well as access to the project premises and activities.

The evaluation reports shall be shared with the partner country and other key stakeholders. The implementing partner and the Commission shall analyse the conclusions and recommendations of the evaluations and, where appropriate, in agreement with the partner country, jointly decide on the follow-up actions to be taken and any adjustments necessary, including, if indicated, the reorientation of the project.

Evaluation services may be contracted under a framework contract.

5.10 Audit

Without prejudice to the obligations applicable to contracts concluded for the implementation of this action, the Commission may, on the basis of a risk assessment, contract independent audits or expenditure verification assignments for one or several contracts or agreements.

It is foreseen that audit services may be contracted under a framework contract.

5.11 Communication and visibility

Communication and visibility of the EU is a legal obligation for all external actions funded by the EU.

This action shall contain communication and visibility measures which shall be based on a specific Communication and Visibility Plan of the Action, to be elaborated at the start of implementation.

In terms of legal obligations on communication and visibility, the measures shall be implemented by the Commission, the partner country, contractors, grant beneficiaries and/or entrusted entities. Appropriate contractual obligations shall be included in, respectively, the financing agreement, procurement and grant contracts, and delegation agreements.

The Communication and Visibility Requirements for European Union External Action (or any succeeding document) shall be used to establish the Communication and Visibility Plan of the Action and the appropriate contractual obligations.

Communication and visibility measures will be implemented under the Contribution agreement with the MS's agency.

Appendix – Intervention Logic Table (for Budget Support)

	Results chain	Indicators (max. 15)	Baselines (2018)	Targets	Sources of data
Expected impact of the policy (Overall objective)	To reduce unemployment, especially among the youth.	Youth unemployment rate (sex disaggregated)	26.9% female 23.6% male	26.9% female 23.6% male	- Statistics Botswana - Botswana Impact Aids Survey (BIAS)
Expected outcomes of the policy (Specific objective(s))	SO1 To increase the availability of TVET graduates with labour market relevant skills.	1.1 Number of students enrolled in technical and vocational education (sex disaggregated). 1.2 Completion rate in TVET programmes (sex disaggregated) 1.3 Percentage of senior-secondary and tertiary TVET graduates who found a job in the areas of training within one year of graduation	1.1 TBD in inception phase 1.2 TBD in inception phase 1.3 TBD in inception phase	1.1 TBD in inception phase 1.2 TBD in inception phase 1.3 TBD in inception phase	1.1 Statistics Botswana, MOBE, MOTE 1.2 Statistics Botswana, MOBE, MOTE 1.3 Statistics Botswana, MOBE, MOTE)

<p>Induced outputs</p>	<p>IO 1: Governance and accountability of the Education/TVET sector are strengthened</p>	<p>1.1 Status of the definition of roles and functions of the various ministries and parastatals involved in ETSSP implementation</p> <p>1.2 Status of the definition of the TVET governance stakeholders' roles and responsibilities</p> <p>1.3 Extent of the private sector's involvement in the governance and practical management of TVET needs.</p> <p>1.4. ETSSP coordination is institutionalized and operational across the relevant Ministries</p>	<p>1.1 No definition in place (2018)</p> <p>1.2 No definition in place (2018)</p> <p>1.3 Tbd</p> <p>1.4. Forum of three Permanent Secretaries of the three ministries involved in Education/TVET (MoBE, MoTE and MELSD) chaired by the Assistant Minister for MoTE and the ETSSP technical coordination team based in MoBE.</p>	<p>1.1 Structure and functions described</p> <p>1.2 Structure and functions described and operational from the national through to the local level</p> <p>1.3 Arrangements and incentives to encourage participation of the private sector in TVET are in place</p> <p>1.4.1. The Inter-ministerial steering committee (ISC) is officially established by a Cabinet order or equivalent</p> <p>1.4.2. Release of a Joint annual Education sector review, with TVET sub-sector included with a gender sensitive approach</p> <p>1.4.3. Two meetings of the ISC and submission of respective reports to the overseeing institution during the last 12 months</p>	<p>1.1 Official data from MoBE</p> <p>1.2 Official data from MoTE</p> <p>1.3 Programme ,monitoring framework</p> <p>1.4. Records and official documents from ETSSP coordination unit – Ministry of Basic Education (MoBE) Reports from ETSSP ISC</p>
-------------------------------	---	---	--	---	---

<p>Induced outputs</p>	<p>IO 2: Quality & relevance of TVET Programs are improved</p>	<p>1.5. TVET governance body is institutionalised and operational, with participation of relevant public stakeholders and the private sector</p> <p>2.1 Percentage of funds annually invested per teacher and trainer in teachers' and trainers' education and training.</p> <p>2.2 Percentage of teachers and trainers participating at accredited in-service training programmes in total number of registered teachers and trainers (disaggregated by sex and category: teachers and trainers)</p> <p>2.3 Status of a strengthened permanent mechanism for analysis and anticipation of skills needs, with reference to national and local development strategies</p> <p>2.4. Status of implementation of the roll-out plan for Multiple pathways</p>	<p>1.5 There's no TVET governance body.</p> <p>2.1 To be defined in inception phase</p> <p>2.2 To be defined in inception phase</p> <p>2.3 To be defined in inception phase</p> <p>2.4 No schools implementing multiple pathways</p>	<p>1.5. The governance body is fully established and functional</p> <p>2.1 To be defined in inception phase</p> <p>2.2 To be defined in inception phase</p> <p>2.3 HRDC sector committees are fully operational for the Agriculture and Tourism and Hospitality sectors at national and local level</p> <p>2.4.1. Two schools and 1 brigade rehabilitated and equipped to deliver the programmes (tourism and agriculture)</p> <p>2.4.2. Pathways are rolled out with 2 programmes (tourism and agriculture) in 2 schools</p> <p>2.4.3. The two schools have signed MoUs with private sector entities for on-the-job training</p> <p>2.4.4. The 2 programmes are extended to 3 additional schools</p> <p>2.4.5. Assessments and national examinations conducted for the 2 programmes (tourism and agriculture)</p>	<p>1.5. Official documents and records from MoTE/ HRDC Reports from ETSSP ISC</p> <p>2.1 Programme monitoring framework Official data from MoBE, MELSD and MoTE</p> <p>2.2 Programme monitoring framework Official data from MoBE, MELSD and MoTE</p> <p>2.3 Programme monitoring framework Official data from HRDC</p> <p>2.4. Official documents and records from MoBE and MLG Joint annual Education Sector review</p>
-------------------------------	---	--	--	--	---

<p>Induced outputs</p>		<p>2.5. Number of in-service trained teachers trained to deliver Multiple Pathways programmes</p> <p>2.6. Number of new learning programmes which have been developed with the participation of the private sector , aligned to the NQF and accredited</p> <p>2.7 Status of the assessment and examination systems for outcomes based education</p>	<p>2.5. 0 teachers trained out of 1700</p> <p>2.6. Four learning programmes</p> <p>2.7 National Policy on Assessment for General Education and Assessment Regulations for Senior Secondary Education presented to Cabinet for endorsement</p>	<p>2.5.1: 765 teachers trained in core subjects and 12 in multiple pathways programmes on Agriculture and Tourism</p> <p>2.5.2: additional 458 teachers trained in multiple pathways learning programmes</p> <p>2.5.3: additional 503 teachers trained in multiple pathways learning programmes</p> <p>2.6. Forty two new learning programmes for Multiple Pathways</p> <p>2.7 National Policy on Assessment for General Education and Assessment Regulations for Senior Secondary Education are endorsed</p>	<p>2.5. Data from MOBE – department of teachers training / MOTE – department of teachers training</p> <p>2.6. Data from MoBE - Department of Curriculum development</p> <p>2.7 Official documents from MoBe and BEC</p>
-------------------------------	--	---	---	---	---

Induced outputs	IO 3: Gender sensitive work based learning opportunities are provided	<p>3.1 Number of beneficiaries taking apprenticeships and other work based learning opportunities offered by employers with the government’s facilitation (disaggregated by sex, age and sector)</p> <p>3.2 Status of the official regulation for internships in the workplace targeting women in technical and professional pathways</p> <p>3.4. % of women attending last year of technical training that are following work based learning programme in a private company (age and sector disaggregated)</p>	<p>3.1tbd</p> <p>3.2 no regulation in place</p> <p>3.4. Tbd</p>	<p>3.1tbd</p> <p>3.2 regulation endorsed and implemented</p> <p>3.4. 75% of women attending the last year of technical training are following work based learning in a private company</p>	<p>3.1 programme monitoring framework</p> <p>3.2 Official data from MoBE</p> <p>3.4. Data from MoTE/HRDC</p>
------------------------	--	--	--	---	---

Direct outputs	DO1. Additional fiscal space created by the transfer of funds.	1.1 Amount of EU funds delivered through Budget Support	1.1.0	1.1. 10MEUR	1.1 official documents confirming disbursement
	DO2. Improved policy dialogue and reduced transaction costs.	2.1 Number of partnerships with the private sector for provision of work based training established thanks to the support of this Action	2.1 0	2.1 tbd	2.1 programme monitoring framework
	DO3. Strengthened capacities conducive to the implementation of TVET Policy and ETSSP.	2.2 Frequency of policy dialogue between the GoB and the EU Delegation	2.2 tbd	2.2 tbd	2.2 programme monitoring framework
	DO4. Improved coordination, monitoring and reporting of reforms.	3.1 Number of Ministries and parastatals' staff involved in ETSSP implementation capacitated to implement on their mandates to plan, monitor, evaluate and report	3.1 tbd	3.1 tbd	3.1 programme monitoring framework
		4.1 Status of the comprehensive M&E system for ETSSP implementation	4.1 M&E system has to be revised to encompass TVET and approved	4.1 M&E system has been put in place and is used	4.1 Joint annual sector review
		4.2 Status of the annual TVET implementation review and evaluation	4.2 no annual TVET review is taking place	4.2 Annual TVET implementation review and evaluation is undertaken and feeds into the Education and Training Joint annual sector review	4.2 Joint annual sector review